

Content lists available at [Indonesia Academia Research Society](https://www.indonesiaacademia-research-society.com)

International Journal of Sustainable Development & Future Society

Journal homepage: ejournals.indoacademia-society.com

Original Article



Investigating the Gender Mainstreaming Policies on the Political Sector in West Sumatra, Indonesia: An Analytical Approach

Afisa Afisa ^a, Sri Sutjiatmi ^a and Diryo Suparto ^{a,*}^a Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Pancasakti Tegal, Tegal Timur, 52121 Kota Tegal, Jawa Tengah, Indonesia.* Correspondence: suparto.diryo@gmail.com (D.S.)

Article History

Received 8 January 2024
 Revised 22 April 2024
 Accepted 6 May 2024
 Available Online 31 May 2024

Keywords:

Policy effectiveness
 Gender mainstreaming policies
 Political sector
 Indonesia context

Abstract

Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) is a government strategy to ensure that men and women gain access, participation, control, and fair benefits in development, including in the political field. Although the Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) policy has long been echoed in West Sumatra, the Gender Development Index (IPG) in the political sector in West Sumatra Province is still below the provincial and national averages. This study will describe how the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) policies in development, especially in the political field in West Sumatra Province, uses four variables of public policy effectiveness from Edward III's theory, namely Communication, Resources, Disposition or Attitude of Executors, and Bureaucracy. The results of the study show that the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) policies in the political field in West Sumatra Province has not been full as planned. This is due to the lack of socialization and coordination between implementers as well as the economic and social environment that has not supported the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in West Sumatra Province and the inadequate availability of human and financial resources. On the one hand, the participation and cooperation of regional apparatus organizations of the West Sumatra Province have been good in designing and responding to Gender Mainstreaming policies.



Copyright: © 2024 by the authors. Submitted for possible open-access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY 4.0) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

1. Introduction

In the current era of global societal guidance, issues related to gender are still the subject of heated public discussion and are still being fought for both at the executive and legislative levels. Introducing the topic of gender equality is part of a development strategy to empower people to strengthen a country's ability to develop, reduce poverty, and govern effectively (Restoeningroem, 2018). Gender is not just a matter of equality between men and women but more broadly relates to mindset and perspective (Puspitosari & Maharani, 2014). The government has made various efforts to reduce the gender gap through national development policies and programs developed in terms of gender mainstreaming (Valentina, 2019). Gender

mainstreaming is a strategy to integrate gender as a policy which needs to fulfill several prerequisites so that the gender mainstreaming process considers the behavior patterns of everyone by embedding gender-sensitive practices in every decision-making (Minto & Mergaert, 2018). There are four prerequisites for gender mainstreaming used in analyzing gender equality in a country, namely the commitment of the government and authorized institutions, the availability of gender-disaggregated data, the existence of a gender-responsive budget, and the existence of gender analysis (Nasrullah, 2021).

Article 27, paragraph 1 of the 1945 Constitution states that there is a state guarantee of equal rights for every citizen in terms of law and governance, decent

work and livelihood, efforts to defend the country, and even obtaining education without discrimination or special treatment. This was clarified by the issuance of Presidential Instruction (INPRES) Number 9 of 2000 concerning Gender Mainstreaming in National Development, which obliges all departments and non-departmental government agencies both at central and regional scales to carry out gender mainstreaming in policies and programs that are under the tasks and their respective responsibilities cover all planning, formulation, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of national development policies and programs.

The political world is one of the representations of the importance of gender equality because women have a very strategic meaning in providing understanding and uniting perceptions about the importance of developing a healthy, just, and realistic democracy (Gusmansyah, 2019). The existence of Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 7 of 1984 concerning the Ratification of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women is proof of the government's seriousness in wanting to eliminate all forms of discrimination against women in any field, including politics. Previously, the issue of gender equality and women's empowerment was included in the third goal of the eight central issues in the 2015 Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) declaration. Still, because it had not been realized, it continued to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) with a target of achieving it in 2030 (Siregar, 2022).

Previous research from Arenawati et al. (2020) found that affirmative action in the political field shows that women's participation is still low, which is inseparable from obstacles in the form of public perceptions of the quality of female cadres, women's self-confidence, family support factors, and background family (Arenawati et al., 2020). The same thing was also found in Nurbaity's research (2018), which concluded that women's political participation in Indonesia is low, influenced by a political culture that tends to be patriarchal, which builds the perception that women are inappropriate, unsuitable, and unfit to enter the world of politics (Yuwono, 2018). Research by Debski et al. (2018) explains that women's participation in terms of gender equality in politics can help loosen hierarchical traditions and networks that are dominated by men, thus reducing power distance and masculinity in society (Debski et al., 2018).

The difference between this research and previous research is that this study examines the extent to which Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) policies are implemented in the political field, specifically for women's participation in West Sumatra, which is known for its matrilineal cultural system but on the other hand is still dominated by patriarchal culture. This paper will answer two questions: RQ1: How is Minang women's involvement in politics progressing? RQ2: How is the Gender

Mainstreaming (PUG) policy implemented to achieve gender equality in the political field in West Sumatra?

2. Materials and Methods

This paper uses a qualitative descriptive research method with a literature study approach. According to Kirk & Miller, qualitative research is a particular tradition in the social sciences that fundamentally depends on observing humans in their area and relating to these people in their language and terminology (Angrosino & Rosenberg, 2011; Becker, 1996; Kirk et al., 1986). Qualitative research aims to explain a phenomenon by collecting data that shows the importance of the data being studied. At the same time, the descriptive method is used to describe or analyze a research result but not to make broader conclusions (Sahir, 2021). The library approach is a study that uses data analysis based on written materials in the form of published notes, books, magazines, newspapers, manuscripts, journals, or articles related to the problem being researched. Data analysis in this study uses the policy implementation model pioneered by George Edward III, which consists of four indicators namely; 1) Communication, 2) Resources, 3) Disposition or Attitude of Executors, and 4) Bureaucratic Structure (Sutmasa, 2021).

3. Results and Discussion

Presidential Instruction (INPRES) Number 9 of 2000 concerning Gender Mainstreaming in National Development explains that gender mainstreaming is a strategy to integrate gender into an integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs. Meanwhile, according to the United Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) (1997), Gender Mainstreaming is the process of determining how any planned actions will affect women and men, including when making laws, policies, or programs at all levels and in all sectors (Ayissa Tazkia et al., 2022). Gender Mainstreaming is a global strategy to achieve gender equality that integrates it from the planning stage to the monitoring and evaluation stage of a policy or program (Poma & Tueno, 2021).

Given gender equality, efforts to guarantee equal opportunities for men and women are included in the concept of gender mainstreaming, where efforts to maximize the roles of men and women in the family and end discrimination based on gender categories are also included (Firmando, 2020). The gender mainstreaming framework prioritizes gender as an entry point to tackle inequality, whereas intersectionality refuses to prioritize any one factor in understanding and responding so that a comprehensive understanding is needed to develop and strengthen responses to injustice in line with the experiences and needs of diverse populations (Hunting & Hankivsky, 2020).

Gender mainstreaming also includes gender-specific interventions to address severe inequalities and imbalances, achieved by providing women with a sense of justice and gender equality (Kasanah, 2021). Gender mainstreaming aims to ascertain whether women and men gain equal access to development resources. Second, participate equally in the development process, including the decision-making process. Third, they have the same control over development resources. Fourth, the same benefits from development results can be obtained (Arjani, 2021). The ultimate goal to be realized by Gender Mainstreaming is to reduce or possibly eliminate gender inequality (Rahayu, 2017)

Gender equality is one of the components of democratization, which creates access and opportunities for people from various backgrounds to participate and carry out the democratization process (Novita et al., 2018). Gender equality also refers to the existence of equal opportunities and rights for men and women to be involved in political, legal, economic, sociocultural, educational, and national defence and security (Defence and Security) activities, as well as convenience in enjoying development outcomes such as that (Katili et al., 2020).

In terms of demands for a balance of roles in gender relations, gender equality, as it is currently understood, is important in Western nations where talks and training are aimed at raising awareness about gender relations (Gusmansyah, 2019). Men continue to wield disproportionate power in Indonesian politics, from the most basic levels of the family to official politics. Hence, women are more likely to engage in politics when they are aware of their rights as citizens, which is facilitated by the fact that they are underrepresented in politics. Not many people defend them (Suprpta, 2020).

Several things can be done to boost women's political participation. First, increasing the role of women in politics is one of the crucial aspects of the democratization process, which is the role of political parties in laying the foundation. In particular, the involvement of political parties in Indonesia, including women at the party management level, is still very low, and this system does not yet exist. Second, affirmative action that covers 30% of women's representation must be used to improve the quality of women's participation in politics (Wahyudi, 2018).

According to Edward III (1980), communication is the main factor that influences the ability of a policy to be implemented successfully. The resource is used as a criterion to measure the sub-variables of both implementations. The ability to utilize existing resources is critical to the success of the policy implementation process (Herdiana, 2020). Bearing in mind that the Gender Mainstreaming Program covers all development initiatives that can be implemented by considering women's opportunities and access to these initiatives,

with control and benefits for women, they must be able to access the various resources needed, be in the form of people, money, time, or other resources (Arora-Jonsson & Sijapati, 2018). The third sub-variable, namely the attitude or disposition of policy implementers, determines the strategy for carrying out a public policy. Therefore, it is very important that policy implementers know what to do and can do it, ensuring that there is no bias in actual implementation if a policy is ineffective (Jachimowicz et al., 2019). The Disposition Variable will see how actively the policy implementation team participates in carrying out the policy programs that have been prepared. The fourth sub-variable is bureaucracy.

The success rate of implementing gender mainstreaming policies in West Sumatra to increase women's interest in politics can be seen based on the following four indicators.

3.1. Communication

The establishment of the 2016-2021 West Sumatra Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) is a reference and priority in implementing regional development, as well as in the development of the Women's Empowerment and Child Protection sector which emphasizes three missions, namely (1) Increasing integration in gender development and gender empowerment and fulfilling children's rights, (2) Strengthening the role and function of gender mainstreaming (PUG), and (3) Increasing the protection of women, children, and fulfillment of children's rights. One of the problems found by the Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (DPPPA) of West Sumatra Province as contained in the Strategic Plan (Restra) for 2016-2021, namely the representation of women in politics and decision-making, as well as the role and participation of women in politics has not been maximized. Data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS) for West Sumatra Province regarding the number and percentage of Female Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) members in West Sumatra for 2019-2021 shows that.

Table 1. Member of the Women's Legislative Council of West Sumatra Province 2019-2021

Regency	2019		2020		2021	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%
Kab. Kepulauan Mentawai	-	0	0	-	0	0
Kab. Pesisir Selatan	3	7	3	5	2	4
Kab. Solok	3	9	3	5	3	6
Kab. Sijunjung	4	13	4	7	3	6
Kab. Tanah Datar	3	9	3	5	2	4
Kab. Padang Pariaman	-	0	0	0	0	0
Kab. Agam	4	9	4	7	4	8
Kab. Lima Puluh Kota	2	6	2	4	2	4
Kab. pasaman	3	9	3	5	3	6
Kab. Solok Selatan	-	0	-	-	0	0

Regency	2019		2020		2021	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%
Kab. Dhamasraya	2	7	2	4	1	2
Kab. Pasaman Barat	3	8	3	5	3	6
Kota Padang	6	13	7	13	4	8
Kota Solok	1	5	2	4	1	2
Kota Sawahlunto	4	20	4	7	4	8
Kota Padang Panjang	2	10	2	4	3	6
Kota Bukittinggi	2	8	2	4	2	4
Kota Payakumbuh	3	12	4	7	4	8
Kota Pariaman	1	6	1	2	1	2

Source: BPS Provinsi Sumatera Barat (2022)

The involvement of women in political representation is also a key component that will be discussed in critical studies on the maturity of democracy, which makes women's representation in regional legislatures and political constellations very important (Alrdi, 2021). Table 1 indicates that most of the regencies/cities in West Sumatra province have experienced a decrease in the number of women's representation in parliament, especially the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) in 2019-2021. Some regencies, such as Mentawai, Solok Selatan, and Padang Pariaman districts, do not have women representatives in the DPRD. This is supported by the statement of the West Sumatra General Election Commission (KPU), which has determined 65 elected candidates for West Sumatra DPRD members for the 2019-2024 period where only four women were declared passed or this number was less than the composition of DPRD members for the previous 2014-2019 period, namely seven women (Nasution, 2019).

The implementation of a policy requires the importance of balancing the roles of government and society in communication because the more effective the communication is, especially related to gender mainstreaming between the parties involved, the easier it will be to understand the information conveyed to the public (Gilbert et al., 2018). According to Edward III, three key factors must be considered in the policy communication process: transmission, consistency, and clarity. Transmission is communicating a message or information through a channel or media to the recipient of the information with a certain effect (Putra & Khaidir, 2019). Suppose there is rejection and disagreement regarding implementing the policy in the transmission. In that case, it will result in delays in the communication process or even distortion that can encourage policy implementers to implement the policy following their understanding (Azmy & Pertiwi, 2021).

The Provincial Government of West Sumatra, especially the Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (DPPPA), implemented a gender mainstreaming program (PGU) in the political field in the form of communication in the form of outreach to political education to increase the participation of women's representation in the political sphere. However,

this has not run optimally, as evidenced by the fact that West Sumatra Province has not exceeded the requirements of Law Number 8 of 2012, which requires every political party to participate in elections to fulfill a quota of 30% women's representation. The factor of patriarchal culture, which assumes that only men are appropriate in the political sphere because politics is synonymous with power in decision-making and the perception that politics is a dirty and brutal field that makes women vulnerable is also a factor that limits women's participation in politics (Wiranti, 2021).

3.2. Resources

Resources are an important factor for policy implementation to be effective and can be in the form of human resources, namely implementing competency and financial resources (Delpiero Roring et al., 2021). There is a need to raise awareness that the success or failure of a policy depends on support to provide an efficient design for policy implementation and prevent the effects of conflict and ambiguity from policy implementation (Hudson et al., 2019). Collaborative and explorative mindsets are important success factors that must be built among resources so that training and development are needed, especially in implementing a policy (Müller et al., 2018). One of the goals of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) is to create suitable conditions for the creation of "sustainable, innovative and people-oriented" economic growth that enhances job prospects, especially for the younger generation and women (Chams & García-Blandón, 2019).

On the basis of data from the Strategic Plan (Renstra) of the Office of Women's Empowerment, Child Protection, Population Control and Family Planning (DPPPAPKB) of West Sumatra Province for 2021-2026, it is stated that the resources owned by the Office of Women's Empowerment, Child Protection, Population Control and Family Planning (DPPPAPKB) West Sumatra Province in implementing the Gender Mainstreaming program, namely 53 employees with various levels of education ranging from junior high school to master's degree where based on a study of employee needs, the ideal number of employees needed in 2021 is 77 people with a composition of bachelor's, diploma and senior high school respectively - every 12 people, 8 people, and 4 people. Although in terms of resources, the implementation of the Gender Mainstreaming program in West Sumatra Province is still inadequate, efforts to meet employee needs are by recruiting quality employees and conducting long and short-term training to increase their capacity, including optimizing the budget

3.3. Executor's Disposition (Attitude)

Disposition refers to the attitude of implementation and the level of dedication to the policy or program that

must be carried out because each policy requires an executor who has a high motivation to implement it and is fully committed to achieving the desired policy objectives (Juliar & Dahtiah, 2020). Collaboration has the potential to support policy improvement by facilitating the development of a shared understanding of complex issues and creating social structures in which districts, communities, and partners can work together to solve them (Bertelli & Sinclair, 2018). The attitude of the implementers towards public information disclosure can be said to be good because they try to comply with regulations where mutual support between related parties and cooperation carried out by the implementer is an attitude that can support the implementation of public information disclosure policies (Lee & Lee, 2018).

The Provincial Government of West Sumatra, especially the Office of Women's Empowerment, Child Protection, Population Control and Family Planning (DPPPAPPKB), gave a positive response to the implementation of the Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) policy in realizing gender-responsive development, especially for women in politics in the province of West Sumatra. This can be seen from the two core programs designed, namely outreach and policy advocacy, to increase women's participation in the political, legal, social, and economic fields. Gender Mainstreaming Policy (PUG) is important to implement in districts/cities in the Province of West Sumatra because of how the special gender interests of women's participation in the political field have not been fully integrated into development in West Sumatra Province, especially in the aspects of Access, Participation, Control, and Benefits (APKM).

3.4. Bureaucratic Structure

One of the implementations of the Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) program in West Sumatra Province involves the role of the Office of Population Control, Family Planning and Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (DP2KBP3A), the Regional Financial Management Agency (BPKD), and the West Sumatra Women's Empowerment Service. PUG institutions also consist of the Gender Mainstreaming Working Group (Pokja PUG), a gender mainstreaming institution formed at the local government level that functions as a forum for discussion in decision-making to provide recommendations so that all decisions taken are gender-responsive.

In 2016, the Gender Mainstreaming Working Group (Pokja PUG) carried out a series of activities to realize this, including coordination meetings, capacity-building activities for Human Resources (HR) Movers of Gender Responsive Budgeting Planning (PPRG), verification review documents on the Gender Analysis Pathway (GAP) and Gender Budget Statement (GBS) that have been prepared, and the implementation of PPRG Development

activities through Provincial and District PUG Working for Groups in West Sumatra.

In 2020, the Governor of West Sumatra signed a Memorandum of Understanding between the Provincial Government of West Sumatra and the Regional Office of the Directorate of Treasury of West Sumatra Province regarding the Synergy of Improving the Quality and Scope of Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in the Province of West Sumatra as an effort to improve, deliver, and leverage the implementation of gender mainstreaming (DPPPA, 2020). Implementation of the Memorandum of Understanding includes promoting and facilitating Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) in each Regional Apparatus Organization (OPD) through outreach, training, coaching, and technology guidance on Gender Mainstreaming (PUG), Gender Analysis, Gender Analysis Pathway Document (GAP) and Gender Budget Statement (GBS) Decon and Assistance Funds for each Regional Apparatus Organization (OPD) Regional Office of the Directorate General of Treasury of West Sumatra Province Regional Government of West Sumatra Province. In addition to elements of society, it can consist of Community Institutions (LM), universities, the business world and the media. The key stakeholders are the government, namely the Gender Mainstreaming Working Group Team (Pokja PUG) with the Office of Population Control, Family Planning and Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (DP2KBP3A) as the leading sector and Bappeda as the coordinator of the Gender Mainstreaming program which has the greatest influence in compiling Gender Mainstreaming programs/activities in West Sumatra Province.

4. Conclusions

This study concludes that implementing the Gender Mainstreaming program in West Sumatra Province's Political Sector has not been optimal. This can be seen from the findings of researchers on each of the variables used, namely: First, the communication carried out by the West Sumatra Provincial government in implementing the Gender Mainstreaming program has not run optimally, as evidenced by the 2019-2021 period, women's representation in the political field has not fulfilled the 30% quota according to the requirements of Law Number 8 of 2012 concerning General Elections for Members of the People's Representative Council, the Regional Representatives Council, and the Regional People's Representative Council which oblige every political party to participate in elections to meet the 30% quota of women's representation.

Second, the resources owned by the Office of Women's Empowerment, Child Protection, Population Control and Family Planning (DPPPAPPKB) of West Sumatra Province based on the 2021-2026 Strategic Plan have not met the target of an ideal number of employees of 77 people. Third, the Disposition or Attitude of Executors shows positive responsiveness through

outreach programs and policy advocacy to increase women's participation in West Sumatra Province politics. Fourth, the Bureaucratic Structure in which regional apparatus organizations involved in implementing the Gender Mainstreaming program work well together and can expand their network of cooperation with various stakeholders.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, A.A. and D.S.; methodology, A.A.; software, A.A.; validation, S.S. and D.S.; formal analysis, A.A.; investigation, A.A. and D.S.; resources, A.A.; data curation, S.S. and D.S.; writing—original draft preparation, A.A.; writing—review and editing, S.S. and D.S.; visualization, A.A.; supervision, S.S. and D.S.; project administration, D.S.; funding acquisition, D.S. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Author Initials:

A.A. - Afisa Afisa
S.S. - Sri Sutjiatmi
D.S. - Diryo Suparto

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Inform Consent Statement: Informed consent was obtained from all subjects involved in the study.

Data Availability Statement: Not applicable.

Acknowledgments: The authors would like to thank Universitas Pancasakti Tegal, Semarang, Indonesia, for supporting this research and publication. We also thank the reviewers for their constructive comments and suggestions.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

Alrudi, S. (2021). Strategi Politik Identitas Perempuan dalam Pemilihan Umum Legislatif 2019 (Studi tentang Kemenangan Ade Kartika di Daerah Pemilihan II Kabupaten Majalengka). *ARISTO*, 9(1), 93–108.

Angrosino, M., & Rosenberg, J. (2011). Observations on observation. *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 467–478.

Arenawati, A., Prafitri, N., & Widyastuti, Y. (2020). Affirmative Action Untuk Mengurangi Disparitas Gender Dalam Politik di Kota Serang. *Jurnal Administrasi Dan Kebijakan Publik*, 5(1), 75–85. <https://doi.org/10.25077/jakp.5.1.75-85.2020>

Arjani, N. L. (2021). Kesenjangan Gender di Bidang Politik Antara Harapan dan Realita. *Sunari Penjor: Journal of Anthropology*, 5(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.24843/sp.2021.v5.i01.p01>

Arora-Jonsson, S., & Sijapati, B. B. (2018). Disciplining Gender in Environmental Organizations: The Texts and Practices of Gender Mainstreaming. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 25(3), 309–325. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gwao.12195>

Ayissa Tazkia, A. T., Listyaningsih, & Juliannes Cadith. (2022). Implementasi Pengarusutamaan Gender dalam Pembangunan di Kabupaten Pandeglang. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 18(1), 25–44. <https://doi.org/10.52316/jap.v18i1.93>

Azmy, A. S., & Pertiwi, F. (2021). Implementasi Kebijakan Pengarusutamaan Gender (Pug) Dibidang Pendidikan Di Kota Bogor. *Marwah: Jurnal Perempuan, Agama Dan Jender*, 19(2), 160. <https://doi.org/10.24014/marwah.v19i2.10699>

Becker, H. S. (1996). The epistemology of qualitative research. *Ethnography and Human Development: Context and Meaning in Social Inquiry*, 27, 53–71.

Bertelli, A. M., & Sinclair, J. A. (2018). Democratic Accountability and the Politics of Mass Administrative Reorganization. *British Journal of Political Science*, 48(3), 691–711. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0007123416000077>

Chams, N., & García-Blandón, J. (2019). On the importance of sustainable human resource management for the adoption of sustainable development goals. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 141(September 2018), 109–122. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2018.10.006>

Debski, J., Jetter, M., Möhle, S., & Stadelmann, D. (2018). Gender and corruption: The neglected role of culture. *European Journal of Political Economy*, 55, 526–537. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2018.05.002>

Delpiero Roring, A., Mantiri, M. S., & Lapian, M. T. (2021). Implementasi Kebijakan Pemerintah Dalam Penanganan Virus Corona (Covid 19) Di Desa Ongkaw 1 Kecamatan Sinonsayang Kabupaten Minahasa Selatan. *Jurnal Governance*, 1(2), 2021.

DPPPA. (2020). *Penanda Tanganan Nota Kesepakatan Sinergi Implementasi PUG di Sumbar*.

Firmando, H. B. (2020). Potret Pengarusutamaan Gender Dalam Kehidupan Keluarga Batak Toba Di Tapanuli Utara (Analisis Gender Pendekatan Sosiologis). *JISA: Journal Ilmiah Sosiologi Agama*, 3(1), 47–62.

Gilbert, N., Ahrweiler, P., Barbrook-Johnson, P., Narasimhan, K. P., & Wilkinson, H. (2018). Computational modelling of public policy: Reflections on practice. *Journal of Artificial Societies and Social Simulation*, 21(1), 14. <https://doi.org/10.18564/jasss.3669>

Gusmansyah, W. (2019). Dinamika Kesenjangan Gender dalam Kehidupan Politik Di Indonesia. *Hawa*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.29300/hawapsga.v1i1.2233>

Herdiana, D. (2020). Pengawasan Kolaboratif Dalam Pelaksanaan Kebijakan Bantuan Sosial Terdampak Covid-19. *Jdp (Jurnal Dinamika Pemerintahan)*, 3(2), 85–99. <https://doi.org/10.36341/jdp.v3i2.1323>

Hudson, B., Hunter, D., & Peckham, S. (2019). Policy failure and the policy-implementation gap: can policy support programs help? *Policy Design and Practice*, 2(1), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/25741292.2018.1540378>

Hunting, G., & Hankivsky, O. (2020). Cautioning Against the Co-Optation of Intersectionality in Gender Mainstreaming. *Journal of International Development*, 32(3), 430–436. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jid.3462>

Jachimowicz, J. M., Duncan, S., Weber, E. U., & Johnson, E. (2019). When and why defaults influence decisions: a meta-analysis of default effects. *Behavioural Public Policy*, 3(2), 159–186. <https://doi.org/10.1017/bpp.2018.43>

- Juliar, R., & Dahtiah, N. (2020). Implementasi Kebijakan dan Sistem Pengendalian Manajemen E-Budgeting dalam mewujudkan Good Governance (Studi Kasus Pada Pemerintah Kota Bandung) Implementation of Policies and Management Control Systems of E-Budgeting in Realizing Good Governance (Case St. *Indonesian Accounting Research Journal*, 1(1), 162–172.
- Kasanah, H. T. E. (2021). Pengarusutamaan Gender Kabupaten Gunungkidul Refleksi Kesadaran Gender Bupati Badingah (PERIODE 2010-2020). *Journal of Politic and Government Studies*, 10(3), 369–384.
- Katili, N., Potabuga, J., & Rengkung, F. (2020). Politik Identitas Pada Kesetaraan Gender Dalam Pemilihan Kepala Daerah Kabupaten Gorontalo Tahun 2020. *Politico: Jurnal Ilmu Politik*, 11(3), 1–3.
- Kirk, J., Miller, M. L., & Miller, M. L. (1986). *Reliability and validity in qualitative research* (Vol. 1). Sage.
- Lee, D. H. L., & Lee, W. O. (2018). Transformational Change In Instruction With Professional Learning Communities? The Influence Of Teacher Cultural Disposition In High Power Distance Contexts. *Journal of Educational Change*, 19(4), 463–488. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10833-018-9328-1>
- Minto, R., & Mergaert, L. (2018). Gender mainstreaming and evaluation in the EU: comparative perspectives from feminist institutionalism. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 20(2), 204–220. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2018.1440181>
- Müller, J. M., Kiel, D., & Voigt, K. I. (2018). What drives the implementation of Industry 4.0? The role of opportunities and challenges in the context of sustainability. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 10(1). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10010247>
- Nasrullah, I. D. (2021). Pengarusutamaan Gender di Jepang Untuk Mencapai SDG's (Sustainable Development Goals) dalam Perspektif Feminisme Liberal. *Journal of Feminism and Gender Studies*, 1(2), 132. <https://doi.org/10.19184/jfgs.v1i2.25281>
- Nasution, M. S. (2019). KPU: Jumlah anggota DPRD Sumbar perempuan berkurang. *Antaraneews.Com*.
- Novita, I., Jendrius, J., & Adnan, M. F. (2018). Eksistensi Komisioner Perempuan dalam Mewujudkan Kesetaraan Gender pada Komisi Pemilihan Umum di Provinsi Sumatera Barat. *Aristo*, 7(1), 105. <https://doi.org/10.24269/ars.v7i1.1356>
- Poma, M. D., & Tueno, N. S. (2021). Computational Modelling of Public Policy: Reflections on Practice. *Publik: Jurnal Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Administrasi Dan Pelayanan Publik*, 8(1), 105–113. <https://doi.org/10.37606/publik.v8i1.196>
- Puspitosari, H., & Maharani, A. E. P. (2014). Pengarusutamaan Gender di Bidang Ketenagakerjaan. *Ratu Adil*, 3(1), 1–19.
- Putra, R. H., & Khaidir, A. (2019). Concept of George C. Edwards III on Implementation of Regional Regulations No. 12 of 2017 Concerning Youth in Granting Youth Service in West Sumatera. *International Journal of Progressive Sciences and Technologies (IJPSAT)*, 15(1), 236–242.
- Rahayu, W. K. (2017). Analisis Pengarusutamaan Gender dalam Kebijakan Publik (Studi Kasus di BP3AKB Provinsi Jawa Tengah). *JAKPP (Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik)*, 2(1), 93–108.
- Restoeningroem. (2018). Dinamika Pengarusutamaan Gender (Gender Mainstreaming). *Seminar Nasional Dan Diskusi Panel Multidisiplin Hasil Penelitian & Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat*, 578–590.
- Sahir, S. H. (2021). *Metodologi Penelitian* (T. Koryati (ed.); I, p. 83 hlm). KBM Indonesia.
- Siregar, A. M. (2022). Implementasi Pengarusutamaan Gender (Pug) Dalam Mewujudkan Tujuan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan (Sustainable Development Goals/SDGS) Di Kota Pekanbaru. *Doctoral Dissertation, Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syari Kasim Riau*.
- Suprpta, I. N. (2020). Eksistensi Perempuan Buleleng Dikalahkan Politik Lokal Suatu Perjuangan Menuju Kesetaraan Gender. *Locus*, 12(1).
- Sutmasa, Y. G. (2021). Memastikan Efektivitas Implementasi Kebijakan Publik. *Jurnal Ilmiah Cakrawarti*, 4(1), 25–36. <https://doi.org/10.47532/jic.v4i1.242>
- Valentina, A. (2019). Analisis Pengarusutamaan Gender (Pug) Dan Perlindungan Anak Di Kabupaten Lampung Tengah. *Marwah: Jurnal Perempuan, Agama Dan Jender*, 17(2), 195. <https://doi.org/10.24014/marwah.v17i2.4887>
- Wahyudi, V. (2018). Peran Politik dalam Perspektif Gender. *Politea: Jurnal Politik Islam*, 1(1), 63–83.
- Wiranti, R. N. (2021). Pengaruh Kesetaraan Gender Di Birokrasi Terhadap Peluang Pegawai Perempuan Dalam Promosi Jabatan Di Pemerintah Kota Solok. *JDPL (Jurnal Demokrasi Dan Politik Lokal)*, 4(2), 95–109.
- Yuwono, N. P. (2018). Perempuan dalam Kungkungan Budaya Politik Patriarkhis. *Muwazah*, 10(2), 96. <https://doi.org/10.28918/muwazah.v10i2.1781>